

Academic Argument – Critique Rubric

Directions: Use this rubric to evaluate the author's essay. While this rubric is specific to the prompt formula, every prompt is slightly different, so interpret the rubric according to the particular scholarship's requirements!

PARAGRAPH #1: INTRODUCTION / PROBLEM

Story/Essay Element	Yes/No	Comments
Summarizes the problem that society faces.		
Provides an example, with evidence, of this problem .		
Establishes why it should be a societal goal to eradicate this problem .		
Makes a claim establishing position, listing at least 2 reasons that are addressed in the body paragraphs.		
Transitions by mentioning the benefit of the first reason.		

General Paragraph Notes:

PARAGRAPH #2: COMPLICATION

Story/Essay Element	Yes/No	Comments
Identifies the first reason in a clear topic sentence.		
Supports this with cited evidence/examples.		
Elaborates on why this reason proves the claim, explaining the relationship between the evidence and the reason/claim.		
Transitions by logically connecting the discussion to the next reason.		

General Paragraph Notes:

PARAGRAPH #3: CLIMAX

Story/Essay Element	Yes/No	Comments
Identifies the second reason in a clear topic sentence.		
Supports this with cited evidence/examples.		
Elaborates on why this reason proves the claim, explaining the relationship between the evidence and the reason/claim.		
Gives a counterclaim that summarizes the opposition's best argument.		
Refutes this claim with additional logic, evidence, and elaboration.		
Transitions by hinting at the growth society or the user will enjoy if the claim is adopted.		

General Paragraph Notes:

PARAGRAPH #4: CONCLUSION

Story/Essay Element	Yes/No	Comments
Restates the claim, but with authority provided by evidence and logical foundation of the essay.		
Asserts why society, and users, would beneficially grow if the claim is adopted and implemented.		
Expresses optimism and hope for the future, possibly including a call to action to the user to make sacrificial choices in pursuit of the societal goal .		

General Paragraph Notes: