Comparison-Contrast Analysis – Critique Rubric

Directions: Use this rubric to evaluate the author's essay. While this rubric is specific to the prompt formula, every prompt is slightly different, so interpret the rubric according to the particular scholarship's requirements!

PARAGRAPH #1: INTRODUCTION / PROBLEM

Story/Essay Element	Yes/No	Comments
Clearly identifies the 2 subjects that are		
being analyzed.		
Clearly identifies the user of the subjects, and		
what his/her goal most likely is in choosing.		
Gives 1-2 details summarizing the core		
similarities and differences.		
Articulates why choosing only 1 of these		
subjects presents a dilemma, or problem .		
Transition by hinting at the stakes of this		
choice.		

General Paragraph Notes:

PARAGRAPH #2: COMPLICATION

Story/Essay Element	Yes/No	Comments
Clearly identifies the first key sim/diff that is		
relevant to the user.		
Uses evidence to provide details of this		
sim/diff.		
Explains how this sim/diff requires sacrifice		
when choosing only one.		
Transitions by hinting at the next, even more		
significant sim/diff to come.		

General Paragraph Notes:

PARAGRAPH #3: CLIMAX

Story/Essay Element	Yes/No	Comments
Clearly identifies a second key sim/diff that is relevant to the user.		
Uses evidence to provide details of this sim/diff.		
Explains how this sim/diff requires sacrifice		
when choosing only one.		
Transitions with a remark on the stakes of this		
choice , and why it is important to the user.		

General Paragraph Notes:

PARAGRAPH #4: CONCLUSION

Story/Essay Element	Yes/No	Comments
Summarizes the essential cost/benefit of		
choosing Subject #1.		
Summarizes the essential cost/benefit of		
choosing Subject #2.		
Comments on the positive growth the user		
can experience from either sacrificial		
choice.		
(Optional): Suggests a course of action to		
the user (not "you" or the reader).		

General Paragraph Notes: